

Land Inequality and Democratic Change: from land reform to rural territorial development ?

Julian Quan, Natural Resources
Institute, University of Greenwich

Land Inequality and Democratic Change: from land reform to rural territorial development ?

■ IMPASSE IN LAND REFORM

- Shift in policy focus from land distribution to land access: difficulties of and opposition to conventional state led land reforms
- Limited impacts of market based land reforms alongside persistent inequalities and land related political conflicts
- Issues of affordability, global context, diversity of demands for land and rural-urban diversification

■ LAND AND TERRITORY

- Notions of territory and territorial development
- Territorial perspectives on land access, inequality and poverty reduction - theory and practice
- Emerging findings and perspectives

From land distribution to land access

- Redistributive reforms as part of wider historical political and economic transformations
- Practical difficulties of state centralised land reforms
- Land reforms have reached their limit? South Asia and Latin America
- Market liberal global policy context and national political opposition
- Rural – urban diversification and migration
- Focus on people and livelihoods as a pro-poor approach

Market based approaches to and reform

- Side step institutional issues to facilitate market access with integrated loan / grant packages for land, production, infrastructure and technical support
- Beneficiary self- or elite-driven selection
- Dispersed results with low impacts on poorest and patterns of inequality
- Problems of debt and sustainability – similar difficulties to state-led approaches
- Political contestation and ideological controversy
- Realities and potential of rental and leasehold markets especially in Asia

The contemporary impasse in land reform

- Persistence of inequality and political conflicts over land
 - Renewed concerns with inequality: structural problems beyond market failure
 - Unfavourable global context for new small farmers; de-agrarianisation?
 - Urbanisation and livelihood diversification
-
- What forms of institutional change can address structural inequalities in practice?
 - What interventions and alliances are needed to bring this about ?

Territory and rural territorial development

- Notions of territory
 - Geography and (human / political) ecology
 - Territory as political power, cultural identity and market networks
- The idea of territorial development
 - Non-sectoral approach at supra-local, sub-regional scale
 - Co-evolution of social and market networks; social diversity and the construction of territorial identity
 - Linking productive and institutional transformation
 - Critical role of stakeholder and civil society participation
 - Urban-rural linkages
 - Wider markets and territorial competitiveness

Land access and territory

- Demands for land reform are territorially located; land reform groups and social movements construct social capital and territorial identity
 - CPT, MST, Rural Unions and NGOs in Brazil
 - Kinship based land restitution claims in South Africa
- Land and resource conflicts are played out – and are potentially soluble – at territorial scale
 - from *Gestion de Terroir* to *Conventions Locales* in francophone West Africa
 - Indigenous land rights and resource extraction in Amazonia
 - Strangers and locals in the West African cocoa belt

Territorial approaches to land access:

- link land access to livelihoods development and facilitate cross sectoral working
- require analysis of changing patterns of supply and demand in land and labour markets enable mix and match of land access instruments
- can foster social diversity and inclusion in land access
- facilitate civil society engagement with planning and land market interventions

Territorial perspectives on land inequality and poverty

- Dynamic and diversified smallholder economies: family farm and land reform sector; pluri-activity and non-farm livelihoods
- Acceptance of liberalised land (and labour) markets: migration and movements in and out of land reform projects
- New sets of rights for a globalised context: private and collective land rights, the “social wage” (Hart) and shares in democratic development: not all will work the land
- New forms of social – private sector economic partnerships

Emerging findings: Brazil's territorial development experiment

- Struggles for coherence and hegemony within the agrarian development ministry
- Social movements beyond the land agenda: diversity, inclusion, economic development and environment
- Pluralistic approaches and agreement to differ on land reform methods
- Issues of territorial boundaries and overlapping planning frameworks
- Partial ministerial buy-in: Territories vs sectors; agriculture vs agrarian reform; political failure to prioritise agrarian change
- Overcoming parochial localism and the need for legislative change

Emerging findings: South Africa

- IDPs and IRDPs have so far failed to integrate land
- Restitution of indigenous territory and the potential for area based approaches to land reform: Makhado
- LRAD has little or no inequality, poverty and territorial impacts (Limpopo, E.Cape)
- Land reform is not necessarily resettlement: new development partnerships and the scope for unscrambling the apartheid map
- Is there still an economic case for land reform? what sort of economic change is racially democratic ?

Conclusions

- From land reform to democratisation of land access, land use and the quality of development
- RTD as an emergent paradigm to restore rural development?
- Decentralisation and institutional reform
- Reconfiguring state – civil society – private sector relationships
- Significant potential, but limited commitment and experience
- Overcoming inequality involves contestation and reform of institutional frameworks